

Book Notes

Chrysagis, Evangelos, and Panas Karampampas. *Collaborative Intimacies in Music and Dance: Anthropologies of Sound and Movement*. Oxford: Berghahn Books, 2017. ix, 272 pp. list of illustrations and tables, index. ISBN 9781785334535 (cloth) ISBN 9781785334542 (e-book).

Current music scholarship on the relationship between sound and movement addresses a variety of topics including multimodality (Chion and Gorbman 2019), choreomusicology (Veroli and Vinay 2018), musical meaning (Cox 2016), and the Black Atlantic (Hutchinson 2012). While much of this scholarship assumes some aspect of an ecological or an embodied approach, *Collaborative Intimacies in Music and Dance* proposes several alternatives. Addressing an interdisciplinary audience, editors Evangelos Chrysagis and Panas Karampampas present a collection of essays that explore sound and movement in terms of space, corporeality, ethics, and issues of ethnographic method. The book grows out of a conference panel on music and dance collaborations organised for the 13th Biennial Conference of the European Association of Social Anthropologists held in 2014. Not all of the panel participants, however, appear in the present volume.

The editors eschew any one relationship between music and dance in favour of diverse ethnographic approaches. The chapters therefore make a number of different contributions. Chapters address musical spaces as sites of ethical self-fashioning, focusing on aspects of music and dance research that do not depend on musical structure. In some chapters, contributors explore the implications of sound and movement for ethnographic methods. Other chapters evaluate the constitutive roles of non-performers in musical events and scenes.

The collection is organised in five parts consisting of two chapters each. An author biography, notes, and a bibliography follow each chapter. Part one presents case studies of sound and self-awareness. The first chapter by Tamara Kohn and Richard Chenhall analyzes the sound experience of an aikido dojo and a shakuhachi lesson to examine “being in sound as a tool of ethnography” (p. 29). In chapter 2, Yuki Imoto investigates the intersections of identity and musical practice among professional classical musicians from Japan who live and work in London. Both chapters shed light on self-awareness in terms of discursive constructions of identity and the embodied experience of sound.

The next part examines pedagogies of bodily movement. Brenda Farnell and Robert N. Wood engage in dialogue in chapter 3 to reflect on Wood’s approach to choreography and the kind of intimacy that develops among the dancers in his company. In chapter 4, Bethany Whiteside describes the face-to-face social interactions that she uses

in a variety of participatory dance spaces that comprise her field sites. Both chapters describe processes of interaction that organise relationship in dance spaces.

Part three focuses on musical practices and ethical self-fashioning. In chapter 5, James Butterworth presents a portrait of the *animador* (an MC), whose gendered commentary and exhortations to drink facilitate the construction of ethnical selves by concert-goers at a Peruvian *huayno* spectacle. In chapter 6, Chrysis focuses on the ethics of money in descriptions of the career trajectory of a music promoter in Glasgow, as he moves from the DIY scene to status as an independent promoter. Both chapters examine ethical positioning as shaped by social interaction in musical scenes and draw on a conception of agency operating beyond the individual.

In the fourth part, authors address bodies dancing in heterogenous time and space. Ruxandra Ana reports in chapter 7 on how rumba dancers enact “authenticity” for tourists in Cuba. In chapter 8, Mimina Peteraki explores the use of two iconic cinematic dance scenes as touchstones in contemporary Greece for articulating discontent about the economic crisis. The chapters show how people use dance in everyday life to create meaning relevant to present contexts.

The fifth and final part of the book addresses motion, irony, and life-worlds. Karampampas contributes chapter 9 on irony and style in an Athenian Goth scene, illustrating how goths comment on exclusion and inclusion by ironising themselves and others through talk and movement. In the final chapter, Borut Telban presents a rich study of an all-night ceremony performed by the people of Ambonwari, Papua New Guinea. Both authors show how gesture, language, and performance come together in the expression and experience of group belonging.

While the book offers quality scholarship, the collection lacks focus. By accommodating a wide variety of issues and approaches, the editors end up losing conceptual and comparative power. The title “Collaborative Intimacies” is an evocative construction, which promises an exploration of the collective dynamics of music and dance, but the volume is hampered in achieving its full potential. The volume might have benefited from an afterword that develops a point of overlapping concern among the chapter—such as the insight in chapter 6 that subject position cannot be “squarely centered upon ‘the individual’” (p. 157), which is of current interest among scholars of music, dance, and anthropology alike. This said, scholars with interest in the specific areas or issues covered still will find individual chapters useful and, in some cases, inspiring.

ELIZABETH KIMZEY BATIUK

doi:10.1017/ytm.2019.41

References

- Chion, Michel, and Claudia Gorbman. 2019. *Audio-Vision: Sound on Screen*. New York: Columbia University Press.

- Cox, Arnie. 2016. *Music and Embodied Cognition: Listening, Moving, Feeling, and Thinking*. Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press.
- Hutchinson, Sydney. 2012. "A Limp with Rhythm: Convergent Choreographies in Black Atlantic Time." *Yearbook for Traditional Music* 44:87-108.
- Veroli, Patrizia, and Gianfranco Vinay. 2018. *Music-Dance: Sound and Motion in Contemporary Discourse*. New York: Routledge.

Weintraub, Andrew N., and Bart Barendregt, eds. *Vamping the Stage: Female Voices of Asian Modernities*. Honolulu, HI: University of Hawai'i Press, 2017. vi, 363 pp., list of contributors, index. ISBN 9780824869861 (cloth) and ISBN 9780824881481 (paperback).

This essential collection of essays on the visibility of women singers in Asian popular music aims to historicise their rise in conditions of colonialism, postcolonialism, and aspirations toward modernity. Both historical and comparative, and based on analysis of recorded music and media as well as ethnography, the essays in this volume reveal how women singers, actors, and dancers reflected, troubled, and sometimes even caused shifts in gender roles and concepts of gendered modernity in Asia over the last century. *Vamping the Stage* grew out of the Voices of Asian Modernities Project (or VAMP), a consortium between the University of Pittsburgh, Leiden University, and the Royal Netherlands Institute of Southeast Asia and Caribbean Studies. Two conferences organised by the consortium resulted in this book, which narrowed the topic to focus on women's voices; women also make up well over half the contributors. The editors, Bart Barendregt and Andrew N. Weintraub, position the essays in chapter 1.

The editors divide the essays into four parts. The first of these parts focuses on singers under colonial regimes. Yiman Wang's exceptional chapter 2 begins part one with a discussion of how Chinese-ness was heard in early film industries, with an especially noteworthy passage about how film star Anna May Wong derailed audiences' Orientalist expectations by singing with *bel canto* technique in languages like German and French. Yifen Beus also discusses tensions between modernist and nationalist orientations in the Shanghai Film Industry with an examination of singer and actor Zhou Xuan in chapter 3. Zhou created a new social outcast character archetype in Shanghai film who, after a series of struggles, eventually transforms into her true, liberated self; this in turn served as an allegory for 1930s China as a nation. One then might read chapter 5 after chapter 3: in chapter 5, Joshua D. Pilzer provides an alternative reading of film in East Asia by arguing that portrayals of women's suffering in films and songs of early twentieth century East Asia both reflect the failed promises of modernity as experienced by many women and legitimise their suffering. In chapter 4, Tan Sooi Beng reiterates the positive

opportunities afforded to women in colonial Malaya by rapid socio-economic transformation, commoditised entertainment, and new technology. These opportunities unsettled gender norms promoted both by British colonialism and Malay Muslim society.

Part two centres on the nation-state. In chapter 6, Christine R. Yano explains how the voice of Japanese songstress Misora Hibari represented national rebuilding after World War II. Andrew N. Weintraub's chapter about singer Titiek Puspa's relationship with two Indonesian regimes likewise foregrounds how women singers encode ideas about gendered agency under nationalist projects. Amanda Weidman then complicates the volume's portrayal of singers and nation-states by focusing on a South Indian playback singer, L. R. Eswari, who negotiated a career singing archetypal "bad" woman roles while protecting her reputation through religious devotional performance and refusing to appear on camera in her films.

Part three deals with questions of censorship and morality. Soojin Kim's chapter problematises the often-seen dichotomy of good and bad women by revealing how post-colonial South Korea governments censored the genre *trot* because of perceived Japanese influences, even though it portrayed demure and nostalgic femininity. Bart Barendregt then writes about how one Malaysian diva negotiates her career through the idiosyncrasies of local, national, and global Islamic music industries. Lastly, Farzaneh Hemmasi examines how Iranian pop icon Googoosh's twenty-year silence after the Iranian Revolution made her voice a metaphor for disenfranchised Iranians in the eyes of Iranians living in diaspora in Los Angeles.

Part four turns back to bodies and sexuality, beginning with Ricardo D. Trimillos' chapter that demonstrates how "good" and "bad" stereotypes of women were coded onto American and Spanish-influenced music genres and aspirations to modernity in the Philippines. Russell P. Skelchy describes how singer Waldjinah's efforts to navigate gossip about her sexuality in print media impacted her career. Hee-sun Kim outlines how South Korean dance divas laid the groundwork for the K-pop industry. Finally, Jennifer Milioto Matsue pushes questions of gender, modernity, and agency to their limit in her chapter about vocal synthesiser software Hatsune Miku. Hatsune Miku exists only as software and an image, and therefore is the "ideal idol" (p. 320) for the "prosumers" who both consume and control her (p. 324).

The chapters in this volume are excellent. Given the scope of the collection, spanning about a hundred years and more than a continent's worth of popular music, the themes that emerge are remarkably consistent. The text's greatest weakness is its title: the implication that the women discussed in the volume uniformly are or portray "vamps"—or women who use their sexual wiles to manipulate men—ultimately undercuts the intention of its authors despite the term's convenience as a musical metaphor and the title of the symposium. Title aside, this volume is a major expansion of knowledge about popular culture and gender in Asia and globally.

Ó hAllmhuráin, Gearóid. *Flowing Tides: History and Memory in an Irish Soundscape*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2016. xiv. 311 pp., appendices, notes, glossary of Irish terms, references, archive/website resources. ISBN 9780199380084 (cloth) and 9780199380091 (e-book).

In this expansive, densely-packed journey into the world of Irish traditional music through the prism of a regional imaginary hewn from the west coast of Ireland, Gearóid Ó hAllmhuráin establishes a goal “to challenge Clare’s sonic remoteness and re-centre its soundscapes within *longue durée* global flow that influenced Irish music history during the past two centuries” (p. 2). Armed with considerable experience as an academic and musician, and supplementing the resultant text with online audio/visual materials, the author explores the dynamic relationship between the local and the global in Clare as manifest in its ever-changing soundscape. Presented in a largely chronological format across seven chapters that are bookended by an *entree* and *l’épilogue*, the deftness with which the author covers a vast amount of social, cultural, historical, political, and sonic materials is astounding and instructive. He includes insights into French cultural influences and the Great Famine’s profound legacy in nineteenth-century Clare; the tectonic societal shifts brought about by mass emigration; the shaping of the modern state through cultural nationalism; the impact of regional economic development and global tourism; and increased music professionalism and the rise of “Celtic stars.” By tracing the “impact of cultural flows on this ‘isolated’ soundscape from the Napoleonic Wars in the early 1800s to the Celtic Tiger [economic] boom in the period 1995–2005” (p. 2), Clare’s apparent “peripherality” is dismantled. Ajurn Appadurai’s *Modernity at Large* (1996) supplies the book’s theoretical linchpin as the author creatively “uses Appadurai’s prismatic scapes as barometers of *longue durée* change” (p. 4). Clare, as both region-specific and synecdoche, is therefore reconfigured and understood in terms of ethno-, techno-, finance- media-, and ideoscapes. A dizzying array of theorists form a support cast, from Boym to Adorno, Tuan to Husserl, Giddens to Ricoeur, all sitting cheek to jowl alongside local Irish historians, folklorists, anthropologists, musicologists, and local musicians, in an interdisciplinary research project that draws on “history and ethnomusicology, memory and orality studies, cultural geography and media ecology” (p. 10).

Flowing Tides should be read in productive dialogue with, and in some cases, in tension with Irish music research from established ethnomusicologists Sean Williams and Adam Kaul, as well as Irish music scholars Helen O’Shea and Lillis Ó Laoire, whose critical, ethnomusicologically informed music research makes significant contributions to the discipline. All of the above are mentioned by the author but are not engaged with in a sustained way. Therein lies an interesting tension in what the book also seeks to achieve: to break “new theoretical and methodological ground in Irish and, more broadly, Celtic ethnomusicology” (p. 3). Self-identified as both a cultural historian and ethnomusicologist (who was trained in Belfast by John Blacking), throughout this book there is an

implicit—and sometimes explicit—critique of the limitations of the ethnographic present research model in ethnomusicology. In particular, he takes aim at practice by those he terms as “outsiders” who do not appreciate, at least from Ó hAllmhuráin’s perspective, the degree to which Irish music research should be informed not just by a *longue durée* perspective but also by the nuanced and embodied positionality of the culturally informed and musically experienced, performing “insider.” Such ideas challenge Bruno Nettl’s position—and much conventional practice—of informed outsider as ideal ethnomusicological researcher. For all of his largely successful, deliberate efforts to eschew unproductive and simplistic binaries, such as centre/periphery, rural/urban, traditional/modern, etc., this is one binary Ó hAllmhuráin seems unwilling to let go. It is a debate that has long plagued vernacular music studies in Ireland (and its associated diaspora), circulating around issues of authority, intelligibility, and agency when it comes to thinking and writing about Irish music. This is not unique to Ireland. In many post-colonial contexts, the discipline of ethnomusicology may be viewed rather warily as a top-down, imported means of gazing at and understanding the “other.”

As someone who has long engaged with Irish and Irish-American/Irish-Canadian music topics from an Irish Studies position (first at the University of Missouri-St. Louis and more recently at Concordia University), Ó hAllmhuráin’s book proves provocative but, from this reader’s perspective, does not result in the configuring of a new “Celtic Ethnomusicology” to which the author aspires. It does, however, help extend the conversation about how music history and ethnomusicology productively intersect, and ideally it should contribute to discussions about methods in the sub-discipline of historical ethnomusicology while concomitantly testing the insularity of certain Irish Studies perspectives. While Clare music is no longer configured as an impervious, bounded regional music style and repertoire, but rather as something far more sophisticated that is in flux, some exceptionalist discursive and imaginary tendencies lurk beneath the sinuous and elegant prose. But as a book forty years in the making, according to the author, this is undoubtedly a very engaging and informative read from a teacher, writer, and musician whose extensive local knowledge and unbounded passion for his subject matter is clearly evident on every page.

AILEEN DILLANE
doi:10.1017/ytm.2019.43

David, Dena, Jane Gabriels, Véronique Hudon, and Marc Pronovost, eds. *Curating Live Arts: Critical Perspectives, Essays, and Conversations on Theory and Practice*. New York and Oxford: Berghahn Books, 2019. xxiii, 392 pp., list of illustrations, index. ISBN 9781785339639 (cloth), ISBN 9781789201345 (paperback) and ISBN 9781785339646 (e-book).

The role of the curator is said to reveal implicit choices in creative practice and programming, with this publication inviting readers to witness the inner processes and conversations of those who curate or “care” for live—performing, performance or time-based—arts. With the emergence of roles and training programmes for live arts curators and dedicated conferences and festivals, this in-depth volume is a timely and substantial cross-disciplinary contribution. Compiled over four years, the editors of *Curating Live Arts* hope it gives room “for as many kinds of definitions of the practice as there are curators” (p. 6). Case studies and theoretical pieces balance descriptive narratives of specific performances and projects with more analytical chapters from curators, researchers, and practitioners around the globe. The chapters explore the multiple meanings applied to live arts curation: to interact with space, place and content of performance; to provoke, mediate and translate with cultural integrity; and to facilitate multiple viewpoints and varied components for audiences and artists.

Initially borne out of Wesleyan University’s *Institute for Curatorial Practice in Performance* 2014 symposium, *Curating Live Arts* communicates the desire to share resources and document research as “too often our best curatorial conversations take place out of sight and in the margins” (p. 82). Engaging in critical discourse beyond institutional and geographical limits, this volume aims to bring “a diverse range of voices into this burgeoning field” (p. 83). Organised into six broad thematic areas, in addition to the “Prologue,” “Collective Introduction,” and “Epilogue,” the editors invite readers to curate their own experience of the book, with “Curatorial Statements” interspersing the thirty-eight chapters across each section. The first part explores “Historical Framings” of curation across time, its controversial beginnings and political possibilities when “curatorial practices can become preparation rituals for social change” (p. 41). The “Ethical Proposals” of part two explore power dynamics behind curatorial choices, particularly within contemporary dance, with rallying cries to better the situation of fellow live arts practitioners by improving curatorial “equity” (p. 101). “The Artist-Curators” who “seized the right to present their work” (p. 143) are represented in the third part of the book, which includes a diverse range of art forms, including music, poetry, and interdisciplinary work. This section also features artist-activists engaging the principle of “inreach” rather than outreach in collaborative community work (p. 155). Part four of the book, focused on “Exhibition as Events”, examines the relationship between performance and material knowledge in the shift from relics to relationships (p. 252) discussing both the “historical present” (p. 246) and the “Future Archive” (p. 228). The fifth section of the book assesses

the unpredictability, fragility and potential transformative power of community-based curation, that can be “a friendly provocation at a time of catastrophes” (p. 290), such as with the *ARC.HIVE of Contemporary Arab Performing Arts*, in “Artivism.” The book’s final section on “Institutional Reinventions” positions curatorial practice as both a product of “late capitalism” (p. 323) and that which can act as a “decolonial gesture” (p. 340). Here, chapter 33 effectively defines the emergence of the curator within European performing arts, a historical grounding that may have been usefully situated earlier in the publication.

Though the book does include welcome international contributions, and more are discovered via notes and references accompanying each chapter, there is an overarching North American-European presence throughout, acknowledged in the “Collective Introduction” as the mutual perspective of the four editors. The inclusion of interconnected researchers allows the reader to witness processes and projects from overlapping perspectives and the combination (or curation) of chapters into sections does draw attention to relevant themes. However, the references in the “Epilogue” to chapters elsewhere in the book could have happened more regularly, particularly where direct overlaps in content or viewpoints are found. As a result, the frequent mention of dance in museum contexts, multiple mentions of the origins of “curate” in Latin root *curare*, and several mentions of Chantal Mouffe’s concept of “agon” or “agonism” obfuscates cohesive conversation. There also are some unfortunate typos, including the misspelling of artists’ names and some incorrect page numbers and missed entries in the Index, but overall these are minor issues in what is altogether an impressive publication.

Curating Live Arts provides an invaluable opportunity to deepen engagement with the myriad forms of live arts and curation, while offering insights to those interested in performance/dance/theatre/cultural studies, museology, and community arts. This book is an important contemporary resource and a unique opportunity to collectively hear the theorist-practitioners at the forefront of this inventive international movement.

NATALIE MASON

doi:10.1017/ytm.2019.44

Veal, Michael E., and E., Tammy Kim, eds. *Punk Ethnography: Artists and Scholars Listen to Sublime Frequencies*. Middletown, CT: Wesleyan University Press, 2016. 402 pp., discography, list of contributors, index. ISBN 9780819576521 (cloth), ISBN 9780819576538 (paperback) and ISBN 9780819576545 (e-book).

The edited volume *Punk Ethnography* is a collection of essays and interviews that provide context to the much acclaimed, and much critiqued, world music label Sublime Frequencies (SF). The label, co-founded by Hisham Mayet, and brothers Alan and Rick Bishop, presents musics and sounds of the “fourth world” (p. 32) in a “cut up” (p. 146), avant-

garde framework; it exists as a platform for sound ethnographies that virulently eschew the ivory tower field of ethnomusicology. *Punk Ethnography* is divided into three main parts, with two “Interlude” sections containing interviews with subjects who are fans of, or who have partnered with, SF in some capacity. Part one provides critical background to SF and the most common critiques of it as a label; part two focuses on how SF artistically formulates its works; Part three takes a geographic tour of various SF albums, especially those contained in the label’s popular *Radio* series.

The introductory chapter makes excellent and succinct work of not only explaining SF as an entity and a culture but also preparing readers for what they will encounter in the subsequent chapters. “We would like to make clear that this collection is not conceived as an *ethnography of a music label*, but rather as *a set of critical essays about an ethnographic music label*. . . through a multiplicity of voices and narrative/rhetorical styles” (p. 14). Thus, while most of the pieces in part one might seem to carry an air of SF apologetics—such as a positive examination of the label’s mission by one of its primary contributors David Novak, or a nostalgic take on the punk band “the Sun City Girls” that preceded and heavily influenced the SF label by freelance journalist and sympathetic fan Marc Masters—the chapters in the remaining two parts are varied in critical approach and style.

Throughout *Punk Ethnography*, authors explore the ideal of the unmediated field recording, the Bishop brothers’ fierce opposition to ethnomusicology, and the aesthetics of “rawness.” Of particular interest are the many ethical questions that have plagued—and continue to plague—the founders’ persistent refusal to attribute authorship to the persons used in/for SF’s productions. As part of its mission, SF prides itself in presenting, without narration and extremely limited liner notes, collages of sounds that constitute the environments—from recordings of local radio broadcasts to clips featuring bird calls and children playing in the street—featured on its albums. Rather than capturing sanitised, high-fidelity audio of singular performances in studios, SF claims to capture the true, “raw” essence of existence in exotic places. Some praise the unmediated recording especially in the face of situations and environments that are already heavily curated by overarching ideologies and agendas (highlighted in E. Tammy Kim’s chapter on SF’s album *Radio Pyongyang*). Others (notably Andrew McGraw’s chapter on *Radio Java*) explicitly call out the contradiction in this notion, as there is indeed *someone* making curating choices about what sound clips to include or discard, and how to cut and arrange them.

The Bishops’ vocal stance against the field of ethnomusicology casts them as anti-establishment Robin Hood-esque heroes of the masses who cannot access the hidden treasures of the outside world. They “rescue” Other musics and sounds from obscurity and disappearance due to Western cultural imperialism and its modern advances. This perception is more fairly stated and justified directly by Julie Strand’s highly experiential chapter on *Bush Taxi Mali*, and ironically by Joseph Salem’s profusely academic chapter on *Radio Palestine*. The Robin Hood perception crumbles, however, as it becomes apparent that SF’s avowed artistic and ethnographic methods tend to project something

akin to a “naturalist” observational stance, which has an odious history of comparing humans in their “natural state” to non-human animals, as described in Lynda Paul’s chapter on SF’s ideology of “rawness.” The image further crumbles in light of SF’s commitment to scant attribution, and distance from critical examination and political discussions clouding the raw essence of the works: this distance runs the risk of dishonouring the lives of the very people whose sounds the albums are meant to highlight, as indicated by Rachel Lear’s chapter on the album *Latinamericarpet*.

The main strength of *Punk Ethnography* is the varied nature of the critical takes: as a whole, it allows readers to absorb many different informed perspectives and come to their own conclusions about SF. In a way, however, it does reify the Bishop brothers’ primary contention with the field of ethnomusicology in terms of limited access to the ivory tower: this book is probably more for the select audience of self-reflexive ethnomusicologists than it is for the average reader of punk-related, or “world music”-related non-fiction. While certainly a strong contribution to academia, one wonders if this book might not have benefited from accepting some of SF’s criticism as valid.

THALEA STOKES
doi:10.1017/ytm.2019.45

CONTRIBUTORS TO BOOK NOTES

ELIZABETH KIMZEY BATIUK received her PhD in Musicology (ethnomusicology) from the University of Michigan in 2015. She has two articles forthcoming: “Choreographic Drag: Body Styling, Discourse, and the Politics of Culture in Cuban *columbia*” and “Calling the Ancestors to Dance: Style, Creativity, and Collective Agency in Abakuá Folkloric Performances in Havana.”

ANDREA DECKER is a PhD Candidate in Ethnomusicology at UC Riverside. She researches gender and sexuality in Indonesian dangdut, focusing on women singers and fans in East and Central Java.

AILEEN DILLANE received her PhD in Ethnomusicology from the University of Chicago in 2009 and is currently director of the MA in Irish Music Studies at the University of Limerick. She has co-edited five books, including *Songs of Social Protest: International Perspectives* (Rowman & Littlefield, 2018).

NATALIE MASON is a Master’s graduate from SOAS, University of London. In September 2019, she begins her PhD in Music (Ethnomusicology and Music Education) at the University of Birmingham as a recipient of the AHRC funded *Midlands4Cities* Doctoral Training Partnership. Natalie is published in *ARTicle Press* and *The World of Music*.

THALEA STOKES is a PhD student (Ethnomusicology) at the University of Chicago, researching Mongolian hip hop culture in Mongolia and China. Portions of their dissertation research have been featured by national and international organisations, including National Public Radio and the American Center for Mongolian Studies.